FILED
Christina Spurlock
CLERK, SUPERIOR COURT
12/08/2023 5:27PM
BY: DHISER
DEPUTY

LAW OFFICES
DANIEL J. OEHLER
2001 Highway 95, Suite 15
Bullhead City, Arizona 86442
(928) 758-3988
(928) 763-3227 (fax)
djolaw10@gmail.com

Daniel J. Oehler, Arizona State Bar No.: 002739
Attorney for Defendants

7

8

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

## IN THE SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF ARIZONA

## IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF MOHAVE

9 NANCY KNIGHT, NO.: CV-2018-04003 Plaintiff, **DEFENDANTS' RESPONSE** 10 TO PLAINTIFF'S MOTION 11 FOR DECLARATORY VS. JUDGMENT ON 12 GLEN LUDWIG and PEARL LUDWIG, Trustees NON-AVOIDANCE OF **ORDERS** of THE LUDWIG FAMILY TRUST; FAIRWAY CONSTRUCTORS, INC.; MEHDI AZARMI; 13 JAMES B. ROBERTS and DONNA M. ROBERTS, husband and wife; JOHN DOES 1-10; 14 JANE DOES 1-10; ABC CORPORATIONS 1-10; and XYZ PARTNERSHIPS 1-10. 15 Defendants. 16 17

Come now, the Defendants, GLEN LUDWIG and PEARL LUDWIG, Trustees of THE LUDWIG FAMILY TRUST; FAIRWAY CONSTRUCTORS, INC.; and MEHDI AZARMI (hereinafter referred to collectively as the "Defendants"), by and through their attorney, the undersigned, and respectfully move this Court to deny Plaintiff's November 20, 2023, Motion for Declaratory Judgment on the issue of non-avoidance of orders. Plaintiff's request is moot. This Court issued a replacement Order directing the Plaintiff to serve the Rule 19 parties on September 13, 2023.

The adoption of the Uniform Declaratory Judgments Act (A.R.S. §§12-1831 to 12-1846) is not intended to be used within litigation already before the Court. This specific point is clearly and succinctly stated in Merritt-Chapman & Scott Corp. v. Frazier, 375 P.2d 18, 92 Ariz. 136 (Ariz. 1962), wherein the Arizona Supreme Court provided the following:

"Plaintiff contends that a cause of action for declaratory relief under the 1 Uniform Declaratory Judgments Act (A.R.S. §§ 12-1831 to 12-1846) was stated in the complaint and amended complaint. 2 3 It was never intended that the relief to be obtained under the Declaratory Judgment Act should be exercised for the purpose of trying issues involved in cases already pending. Staley Elevator Co., Inc. v. 4 Otis Elevator Co., 35 F.Supp. 778 (D.C.N.J.1940). See also Borchard, Declaratory Judgments, 2d Ed., pp. 302, 350, 351. Generally, declaratory relief will be denied when the issue presented by the action 5 is already pending in another forum. Burton v. Lester, 227 La. 347, 79 6 So.2d 333 (1955). 7 The complaint was properly dismissed as to the defendants 8 Bernice M. Frazier, Robert C. Frazier, Jr., Linda Joy Frazier, Kent M. Frazier, and Cleveland J. Frazier inasmuch as the complaint itself disclosed that a case was then pending between these defendants and 9 the plaintiff which involved the same issues as those raised in this action. The Declaratory Judgment Act could not be invoked under such 10 circumstances and the court properly declined to declare the rights of 11 the parties." Id. at pp. 19-20. See also: 12 "The Act' was not intended to constitute a fountain of legal advice for 13 the court." Ariz. Biltmore Hotel Villas Condos. Ass'n, Inc. v. Ariz. Biltmore Hotel Master Ass'n, Corp., No. 1 CA-CV 13-0703 (Ariz. 14 App. Jul 30, 2015), p. 6. 15 \*\*\* 16 "The court may also refuse to enter declaratory relief if such relief would not terminate the controversy giving rise to the proceeding. 17 A.R.S. §12-1836. Ariz Biltmore, supra, at p. 6. 18 19 Declaratory judgment is not properly sought in an effort to obtain an answer from the court on a moot issue or question. Arizona State Bd. of Directors for Junior Colleges v. 2.0 21 Phoenix Union High School Dist. Of Maricopa County, 102 Ariz. 69, 424 p.2d 819 (1967). 22. Plaintiff's Motion should be denied and attorney fees and costs awarded to 23 Defendants. RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED this & day of December, 2023. 24 LAW OFFICES OF DANIEL J. OEHLER 25 26 27 Daniel J. Oehler, Attorney for Defendants

28

1	COPY of the foregoing emailed this day of December, 2023, to:
2	Honorable Dale P. Nielson
3	Navajo County Superior Court Post Office Box 668
4	Holbrook, Arizona 86025
5	(928) 524-4220 Katelin Lerma, Judicial Assistant <u>kalerma@courts.az.gov</u>
6	Plaintiff Plaintiff
7	Nancy Knight 1803 E. Lipan Circle
8	Fort Mohave, Arizona 86426 (928) 768-1537
9	nancyknight@frontier.com
10	Du Equent
11	By: Patricia L. Emond, Legal Assistant
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
ı	I

28